City of Evansville Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Wednesday, October 15th, 2025 at 6:00 p.m. 3rd Floor City Hall, 31 S Madison Street, Evansville, WI 53536

MINUTES

1. Call to Order. Stephans called the meeting to order at 6:00 pm

2. Roll Call:

Members	Present/Absent	Others Present
Chair Dan Stephans	P	Alison/Scott Stoker
Vice-chair Kelly Shannon	P	Chris Keaveny
Vicky Norton	P	Sandy/John Decker
Gene Lewis	P	Jenny Wiedel
Norman Barker	A	Michelle Schaefer
Amy Corridon	P	John/Nancy Peterson
Steve Christens	P	Richard/Tina McGaw
		Melissa Destree

- 3. <u>Motion to approve the agenda as written by Christens, second by Norton. Motion carried unanimously.</u>
- 4. <u>Motion to waive the reading of the minutes from the September 17th, 2025 and approve them as printed.</u> Motion by Norton, seconded by Christens. Motion carried unanimously.
- **5. Civility Reminder.** Stephans noted that the meeting would be conducted civilly.
- 6. Citizen appearances.
- 7. Action Items
 - A. 325 W Main Cover asbestos siding with vinyl siding (HPC-2025-196)
 - **i.** Remove From Table.

Motion to remove by Christens, second by Norton. Motion carried unanimously.

More information provided by contractor suggested that the existing asbestos siding could be repaired with the farming method and was not in bad enough shape where friable material was creating an environmental concern. Several members questioned the risk of creating friable material when foam board was attached to the asbestos siding in order to provide a place for vinyl siding.

- ii. <u>Motion to approve repair of the asbestos siding on front of house using the farming method with non-damaged siding found on the home's rear. Rest of home can be painted to match;</u> by Christens, second by Lewis. Motion carried unanimously.
- B. 354 W Main Street Reroof, replace vinyl siding with same, replace aluminum gutters, cover wood soffit with aluminum (HPC-2025-213)

Discussion revolved around the proposal to remove drip caps, moulding, and other distinct historic features.

Motion to approve roof, siding, and gutter replacement, with the condition that no wood trim, moudling, or drip caps can be removed. Windows with existing aluminum wrap can be replaced, but no other windows should be trimmed with aluminum; by Stephans, second by Corridon. Motion carried unanimously.

C. 251 W Liberty – Reroof, replace aluminum siding with vinyl, wrap windows with aluminum (HPC-2025-214)

<u>Motion to approve application with the condition that smooth shiplap vinyl siding be used,</u> and that only windows with existing wrap may be re-wrapped; by Corridon, second by Shannon. Motion carried unanimously.

D. 20 N First – Reroof house and garage, replace aluminum siding with vinyl on house, replace gutters, replace trim on windows/doors, remove chimney in rear of house (HPC-2025-215)

Applicants Alison and Scott Stoker were in attendance. Mentioned that they were having issues getting insurance to pay for all four sides of siding. Commission members noted they would make this a requirement.

Motion to approve application with the condition that smooth shiplap vinyl siding be used, that all four sides by replaced with new siding, and that only windows with existing wrap may be re-wrapped; by Christens, second by Norton. Motion carried unanimously.

E. 31 Mill Street – Reroof with same materials, replace original windows on 2nd floor with vinyl (Lead Abatement) (HPC-2025-216)

No action taking, invoking Section 62-8 of the City of Evansville Municipal Code.

F. 14 Garfield Avenue – Install custom-made wood storm windows (HPC-2025-217)

Applicant Michelle Schaefer present. Storms are being added as they were not there previously.

Motion to approve application by Christens, second by Norton. Motion carried unanimously.

G. 143 W Main Street – Re-install gutters, replace porches (rear, east, and 2nd street side) in kind and repair existing railings, replace exterior doors with wood exterior/storm doors, rebuild basement door (HPC-2025-218)

Applicants John and Sandy Decker present. They summarized their application.

Motion to approve application by Christens, second by Lewis. Motion carried unanimously.

H. 122 S First Street – Replace wood siding with vinyl (HPC-2025-219)

Applicants Richard and Tina McGaw were present and explained the situation. Their house was ran into by a truck and has led to structural damage that will require most of the siding on the northwest side of the house has to be removed in order to right the building. Much discussion about the merits of the existing siding. Because of the extent of the structural damage and the amount of original material that would need to be removed to keep the building in good condition, commissioners felt using vinyl siding could be mitigated by keeping the wood details under the roof eaves and around the bay window on the south side of the home.

Motion to approve the application with the conditions that smooth shiplap vinyl to be used, details on the bay window and eaves to be retained, and that the approval is because of the extent of the structural damage, by Corridon, second by Shannon. Motion passes 5-1.

- I. 31 S Madison (City Hall)— Reroof with same materials, install gutters/downspouts to match existing, install aluminum fascia to match existing, replace red cedar shake shingle siding, re-wrap windows with aluminum (HPC-2025-220)
 - i. Alternative Bid(s): Restore double-hung 3^{rd} floor windows on front façade, restore historically appropriate oval windows

Melissa Destree is in attendance representing the City. She is the architect directing the repair for hail-damaged municipal buildings. Historic Preservation Commission approval is needed to advance these projects. All City-applications this evening include an alternative bid, which may be used if budgets allow.

Repairs to City Hall are to repair the roof, including gutter installation and fixing flashing on the belfry, which has been an entry point for water and animals. She suggests restoring double-hung windows on the 3rd floor.

Motion to approve the application as described, with the alternative bid being preferred and details to be chosen at the City's discretion. Motion by Christens, second by Shannon. Motion carried unanimously.

J. 10 W Church (Police Station) – Reroof metal roof with same materials, install gutters, downspouts, and HVAC equipment (HPC-2025-221)

Chair indicates this can be approved by the Community Development Director, as it is like-for-like replacement.

K. 11 W Church (EMS office) – Reroof with same materials, install gutters to match existing, replace aluminum fascia to match existing, replace vinyl lap siding on upper façade of front of building (HPC-2025-222)

i. Alternative Bid: repour porch concrete, add smooth square architectural columns, remove vinyl siding and replace with Azek 5" exposure, butt-edged shingle siding

Motion to approve the application without replacing vinyl lap siding on upper facade of building's front, with the alternative bid being preferred and details to be chosen at the City's discretion. Motion by Lewis, second by Corridon. Motion carried unanimously.

- L. 22 W Church (Police and EMS garage) -- Reroof with same materials, install gutters/downspouts to match existing, install aluminum fascia to match existing, replace vinyl lap siding, and HVAC equipment (HPC-2025-223)
 - i. Alternative Bid: Remove fishscale and vinyl; replace with smooth board and batten LP Smart Side

Motion to approve the application, using horizontal shiplap LP siding instead of vinyl.

<u>Alternative bid not approved</u>. By Lewis, second by Shannon. Motion carried unanimously.

- M. 364 Burr W. Jones Circle Reroof with same materials, install gutters/downspouts to match existing, install aluminum fascia to match existing, replace aluminum siding in kind (HPC-2025-224)
- i. Alternative Bid: Remove aluminum install smooth board and batten LP Smart Side Motion to approve the application using the alternative bid, with the condition that the white color be maintained. By Shannon, second by Christens. Motion carried unanimously.
- N. 30 Antes Drive Reroof, with same materials, install aluminum gutters and trim, reside with vinyl to match existing (HPC-2025-225)
- i. Alternative Bid: Remove vinyl and install smooth board and batten LP Smart Side

 Motion to approve the application using the alternative bid, with the condition that the siding be

 grey in color. By Christens, second by Shannon. Motion carried unanimously.

8. Discussion Items

A. 112 W Liberty Garage Options

Property owner Jenny Wiedel in attendance to discuss options for demolishing and rebuilding her garage. The current building is in poor condition. A replacement would reflect some of the distinct features of the original. Consensus among members that they were in support of the type of garage that was shown.

9. Report of the Community Development Director

- A. Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness
- 10. Correspondence, Comments and Concerns
- **11. Next Meeting Date:** November 19th, 2025, 6:00 p.m.
- 12. Motion to Adjourn by consensus.